UNITED NATIONS **E**

Economic and Social Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.6/1995/6
19 December 1994

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN
New York, Thirty-ninth session
15 March-4 April 1995
Item 3 of the provisional agenda*

PREPARATIONS FOR THE FOURTH WORLD CONFERENCE ON WOMEN: ACTION FOR EQUALITY, DEVELOPMENT AND PEACE

Technical assistance and women: from mainstreaming towards institutional accountability

Note by the Secretary General

SUMMARY

The Commission on the Status of Women, in its resolution 35/4, invited the Secretary-General to report on existing technical and financial programmes in favour of women and offer guidelines for overcoming constraints and increasing cooperation in critical areas of concern. The annex to this note responds to that request. It highlights the results of a review undertaken by the Secretariat with assistance from UNDP, UNFPA and UNIFEM under the overall coordination of the World Bank. It makes recommendations for strengthening the impact of United Nations assistance and financing for the advancement of women, including strategies for integrating gender analysis in policy, planning and implementation and for increased accountability for improving the status of women through technical cooperation and financial assistance programmes.

* E/CN.6/1995/1.

94-50856 (E) 050195 100195

/...

1. The Commission on the Status of Women, in its resolution 35/4 of 8 March 1991, invited the Secretary-General to report on existing technical and financial cooperation programmes in favour of women and to offer guidelines for a comprehensive plan to overcome constraints and increase such cooperation with regard to critical areas of concern. In its resolution 37/7 of March 1993, the Commission reiterated its request. In response to these requests, the Secretariat initiated, with assistance from the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and under the coordination of the World Bank, a review of technical and financial cooperation in favour of women as carried out by the United Nations system.

2. The review drew upon existing evaluations of technical cooperation and financial assistance for women's programming which had been carried out by United Nations programmes and agencies. Responses to a questionnaire, which was circulated to all agencies, interviews and a request for information on successful projects were also used. The analysis was based on the characteristics and experience of the agencies rather than an explicit evaluation of each agency's practice.

3. The results of the review are contained in the annex to this note entitled: "Technical assistance and women: from mainstreaming towards institutional accountability". It was prepared by a consultant, Kathleen Staudt, who is an expert in gender and organizational behaviour. The report was reviewed by the agencies in draft form.

4. The review begins by analysing institutional strategies to incorporate gender into the context of prevailing "organizational cultures" and the conditions under which they change. It goes on to compare the relative successes of some of these strategies for mainstreaming gender concerns in the work of United Nations agencies, including policy instruments, procedures, gender training, networking and evaluation. Thereafter, it examines successful and not-so-successful cases to demonstrate the extent to which gender has been mainstreamed. Finally, the review pulls together lessons learned to make recommendations for the future.

5. Technical cooperation for women in development in the United Nations gained importance in the late 1960s when the Economic and Social Council asked the specialized agencies, plus the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), UNDP and non-governmental organizations, to cooperate in the development of a unified long-term programme for the advancement of women. It also asked the Secretary-General to initiate studies on the possibility of supplementing that action by establishing a fund which might be used to assist Governments in implementing their national programmes for the advancement of women. The idea of both targeting women in ongoing programmes and setting up a separate fund resulted in the creation of UNIFEM and in efforts to mainstream women and development programming into agencies engaged in a wide variety of development interventions, from financial assistance to technical assistance in health and humanitarian aid.

6. To move agencies successfully into technical cooperation to benefit women, advocates of women-in-development (WID) have tried a number of strategies,

including urging the adoption of WID policy documents for leverage; advocating for better research and gender-disaggregated data; and justifying the need for both integrated and separate approaches to women in development.

7. The results up until 1985 showed success in relation to policy documents, resolutions and research, but very little in terms of technical assistance offered by operational agencies. The vast bulk of development assistance still bypassed women. Even those projects designed to reach women were often not sustainable.

8. In 1985 at the Nairobi Conference, there was a call for more mainstreaming, though not to the exclusion of assistance targeted at women. The Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women contained a section entitled "Technical cooperation, training and advisory services". 1/ United Nations funding agencies such as UNDP, UNFPA, UNICEF, the World Food Programme (WFP) and the World Bank were called upon to ensure that women benefited from and participated in all projects and programmes funded by those agencies.

9. Definitions of "mainstreaming" however, differ. It can mean

(a) Integrating all agency sectors and operations without raising questions or critiques about those operations;

(b) Transforming the development agency, thereby implying criticism of existing operations - i.e. transformative mainstreaming;

(c) Strengthening women's active involvement in development by aligning women's capabilities and contribution with macro-development issues such as population, the environment, critical poverty, food scarcity, energy and urbanization. This link provides the rationale for drawing upon large-scale resources for development which have not hitherto articulated support or programmatic linkages to women.

This latter definition was clearly used by UNFPA in relation to the proposals put before the International Conference on Population and Development. Issues of equality between men and women permeated the document, which, when adopted, opened the way for extending resources normally earmarked for population-related projects, for example, to programmes for girls' education.

10. The review identifies the shift in conceptual analysis in the late 1980s from a strict focus on women to one on gender. A gender approach attempts to put people at the centre and allows for greater differentiation between men and women and among women. There is also a shift in focus from women's practical needs to strategic needs. The latter is more likely to produce long-term gains in women's empowerment and the sustainable transformation of the mainstream of development.

11. Because "institutional cultures" vary, in terms of era of creation, missions, structures and sizes, diverse strategies are required in order to mainstream gender. The report stresses the recruitment of a "critical mass" of women within an organization as a prerequisite for changing the dominant

institutional culture towards greater gender sensitivity. It, however, points out that men must also share this responsibility.

12. The review concludes that no one "best way" exists to mainstream women into development. A variety of institutional strategies have been tried. The institutional structure usually takes the form of a centralized WID focal point, frequently short of staff and resources and working in relative isolation. Under such conditions, mutually beneficial alliance-building strategies can maximize the quality of outcomes for the whole agency. There is evidence of increasing specificity of policy guidance, coupled with a variety of inputs to assist and educate staff, ranging from checklists and rosters of WID experts to gender training and improved evaluation systems. The review recommends that gender training should be accompanied by institutional commitment and post-training follow-up and support.

13. Given the prevailing difficulty of measuring and monitoring expenditures on a gender-disaggregated basis and of tracing the impact of programmes on people generally, whether male or female, the review points out that the impact on women of multilateral technical cooperation cannot be adequately analysed. It finds that there has been a steady movement in recent years in the United Nations towards accountability-based strategies for women and development programming. Many United Nations agencies have developed explicit policies for WID assistance. The results of efforts to put these policies into practice have, however, been uneven. It recommends the development of a refined set of indicators capable of measuring and monitoring both the quantitative and qualitative impact of various interventions to address gender issues.

14. The review recommends that those agencies with a strong track record in assistance to benefit women should move towards accountability-based approaches. Accountability strategies shift responsibility from a women's unit to other parts of the agency, including personnel units, evaluation offices, and managers and country-level staff. At the country level, accountability strategies stress dialogue with women's organizations and women-friendly advocacy organizations to spread responsibility to Governments for responsiveness to women as well as men. This offers the potential for closer relations between non-governmental organizations and Governments.

15. The review examines the impact of development assistance on women at the country level, since that impact is the outcome for which development agencies exist. A number of successful models demonstrate how agencies have succeeded in moving beyond welfare and efficiency approaches to equality and empowerment approaches. It also found that women-specific or women-targeted efforts continue to be necessary in order to balance the integrated, or mainstreamed, approach.

16. The proposal put forward is for more institutional accountability in political contexts in which empowered women, with men, demand and drive outcomes dramatically different from the ones to be expected from male-dominated decision-making. It recommends that process-oriented input approaches, which have predominated in the past, should be supplemented with approaches that stress people-oriented and gender-sensitive outcomes. In addition, strategies

are required to generate demand within agencies as a whole for the process-oriented inputs already put into place by gender units.

17. Recommendations made in the review pertain to action within the whole system, within agencies, between partners in development, including Governments and non-governmental organizations, and for the users of development assistance.

18. At the level of the whole system, the ability of evaluation units to report people-oriented gender-differentiated outcomes must be strengthened. Monitoring and evaluation systems must provide evidence of agency efforts and funding to promote gender-based outcomes. Agencies must regularly report to system-wide mechanisms (like the Administrative Committee on Coordination, the Commission on the Status of Women, the Economic and Social Council) that make results visible. The review recommends better inter-agency coordination to reduce duplication and build on the comparative advantage of agencies in specific areas.

19. Recommended internal strategies for agencies relate to spreading the responsibility for action on gender throughout the agency, by recruiting more women, increasing commitment to gender-training, devising personnel policies that reward or penalize staff for good work or non-performance on gender, and introducing performance-based gender-differentiated budgeting.

20. The review suggests that a more holistic view of gender needs must be taken in designing development assistance for better gender impact, including incorporating a life-cycle approach to women's health, giving greater attention to the issue of women's control over household income earned by them, and targeting men in gender-programming. Finally, the review stresses the importance of alliance-building between partners in development. For this to be more effective, concrete efforts will need to be made to encourage co-financing of programmes and projects and redefine policies and strategies so as to allow cooperative action to be undertaken within the framework of regular budgets and programmes.

21. The Commission on the Status of Women may wish to consider these points when finalizing recommendations in the draft platform for action in connection with recommendations for strengthening multilateral institutions to implement technical cooperation and to finance programmes for the advancement of women.

Notes

1/ Report of the World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the United Nations Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace, Nairobi, 15-26 July 1985 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.85.IV.10), chap. 1, sect. A.

Annex

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND WOMEN: FROM MAINSTREAMING TOWARDS INSTITUTIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY

Prepared by Kathleen Staudt

CONTENTS

	Paragraphs	Page
INTRODUCTION	1 - 22	7
I. THE CULTURE OF DEVELOPMENT-ASSISTANCE INSTITUTIONS	23 - 67	11
II. INSTITUTIONAL STRATEGIES	68 - 123	23
III. CASES FROM THE FIELD	124 - 161	34
IV. FROM MAINSTREAMING TO ACCOUNTABILITY	162 - 188	47

INTRODUCTION

1. For nearly two decades, most multilateral assistance agencies have developed guidelines or policies that support the integration of women into development programmes. A wide variety of strategies have been adopted to put these policies into operation. As we move towards the year 2000, it is useful to compare these strategies, the obstacles encountered, and the recommendations that flow therefrom. The results of the strategies are not fully known, given the difficulty of measuring and monitoring gender-disaggregated spending and of tracing outcomes for people, male or female.

2. This paper compares the approaches of a group of agencies in the United Nations system engaged in providing diverse forms of development assistance, ranging from financial and technical assistance in specific sectors to humanitarian interventions. Women's unit staff responded to a questionnaire or a letter query, or both, about successful project examples. Additionally, the analysis is based on interviews with various agency staff, documents and internal studies, and group meetings.

3. This comparison demonstrates that agencies have built the foundation for both undertaking women-specific activities and mainstreaming gender into agency missions, sectors and, to a lesser extent, policy dialogue. For mainstreaming to take root, it will be necessary to move beyond this foundation to accountability-based approaches that draw on the full resources, staff, and mechanisms of agencies. Mainstreaming must be done in a way that meshes with agency missions but ultimately challenges them to transform with the help of system-wide, institutional accountability.

A. Organization

4. The move towards accountability-based strategies is based on lessons learned over the two decades devoted to women-in-development (WID) programming. During these two decades, historical lessons were learned, WID language changed, and women's organizations and women-friendly organizations flourished. This section summarizes these historical perspectives and clarifies the changing language once known simply as WID.

5. The staff of women's units have pursued a variety of institutional strategies in their efforts to put policies into practice. Strategies are based on a diagnosis of the host institutions in which they are situated. Institutional missions, language, procedures, and incentive structures provide possibilities for and limitations to just what those staff can do. Chapter I analyses organizational cultures and the conditions under which they change.

6. Chapter II compares the strategies pursued in terms of policy instruments, procedures, gender-training, networking, and evaluation. As the institutions in this study bear out, no one best way exists to integrate or mainstream women into development missions, sectors, and policies. The chapter shows the increasing specificity of policy guidance, coupled with a variety of inputs to

educate staff, ranging from checklists and guidelines to gender-training and evaluation requirements.

7. Country-based action is the outcome for which development agencies exist. Women's policies are unevenly communicated from headquarters to field operations in the form of country-based programming, projects and policy dialogue. Nevertheless, examples of successful models provide ideas and inspirations across agency lines. Chapter III demonstrates how exemplary efforts by women's units have nudged at the core of the mandates of their host agencies and moved them beyond welfare and efficiency approaches to equity and empowerment approaches. The chapter also demonstrates the continuing justification for women-specific efforts to balance the integrated and mainstreamed approaches.

8. Chapter IV pulls together the lessons learned to make recommendations for the future. In sum, the recommendations would move those agencies that have established a firm foundation towards accountability-based approaches. In the narrower context of particular agencies, strategies for greater accountability seek to shift the responsibility from the women's unit to other parts of the agency, including personnel, evaluation, and country staff. In the wider context of countries, strategies for accountability seek to legitimize dialogue with women's organizations and women-friendly advocacy organizations to increase the responsibility of Governments for greater responsiveness to women as well as men.

B. Historical perspective

9. Women-in-development (WID) advocacy, born in the 1970s, has tried and tested strategies to make institutions more responsive to women and thereby to increase the effectiveness of development interventions. These strategies have borne considerable fruit, accounting for the firm foundation on which WID rests in many agencies.

10. The terms "advocacy" and "advocates" refer to the process associated with introducing new and non-routine issues into institutional operations. 1/ Thus, this terminology is also applicable to other new development issues, such as environmental sustainability and the involvement of non-governmental organizations, among others.

11. WID advocates have found that the tried and tested means:

(a) Urge adoption of policy documents for leverage;

(b) Push for better research and disaggregated data;

(c) Justify the need for both integrated and separate approaches.

These early formulas are basic to the introduction of any new issue into the activities of an institution.

12. Over the period of the United Nations Decade for Women (1976-1985), a connection was made between women and development issues in policy documents,

resolutions and research, but its translation into operational practice was minimal. A comparative study in 1985 categorized projects of United Nations agencies into four types, with the following results (Kardam, 1991):

(a) Projects designed exclusively with women in mind - 5 per cent of projects;

(b) Projects designed to include women - 12 per cent;

(c) Projects affecting women but with no provision for women's participation - 56 per cent;

(d) Projects of no interest to women - 27 per cent.

The report also found that the largest category of projects, the 56 per cent which affected women but had no provision for their participation, consumed 63 per cent of the budgetary resources in all four categories. Reports like these suggested that the vast bulk of development projects and resources bypassed women. While projects for women only were guaranteed to reach women, they sometimes did so with a welfare or service orientation and in ways that could not be sustained after project funding ended. One influential study of such projects concluded that "women's projects misbehaved" (Buvinic, 1986).

13. Clearly, new strategies were called for. At the 1985 World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the United Nations Decade for Women, held at the conclusion of the Decade, some consensus emerged that "mainstreaming" should become one of the new strategies. By mainstreaming, people mean different things. One study (Jahan, 1992) identifies mainstreaming as either integrating gender into the work of all agency sectors and operations, not just women-specific ones, but without raising questions or critiques about those operations; or transforming the development agenda, thereby implying criticism of existing operations, hereinafter called "transformative mainstreaming".

14. This latter meaning corresponds to the UNIFEM Director's call for women to make a "qualitative difference" as they enter the mainstream (Anderson, 1990). Still another definition of mainstreaming is:

> Strengthening women's active involvement in development by linking women's capabilities and contributions with macro-development issues such as population, the environment, critical poverty, food scarcity, energy and urbanization. This link provides the rationale for drawing upon large-scale resources for development which have not hitherto articulated support or programmatic linkages to women (UNFPA, n.d.)

This definition is useful in two ways. First, it is in tune with the shift of focus in many agencies away from project and programme assistance towards macro-policy reform. Without linkage to policy dialogue, women's issues may be as invisible, as they were before the 1975 World Conference of the International Women's Year, held in Mexico City. Secondly, women's advocates, who may number a mere handful of staff in an agency of thousands, are not always in a position to challenge the mainstream of their host organizations, much less the dominant

thinking among mainstream thinkers. This definition makes explicit the need for linkages between gender and other sectoral and cross-sectoral issues, some of which also challenge the existing mainstream.

15. This report takes no position on the definition of mainstreaming but recognizes the different approaches existing in different agencies.

C. Some clarification of concepts

16. Besides witnessing the emergence of the new terminology of mainstreaming, WID discourse has become more complex. Advocates increasingly differentiate between the terms "women" and "gender".

1. Women vs. gender

17. The earlier focus on "women" was based on the idea that women were subordinate to men, that women's work and needs were neglected in development planning, and that women's status needed to be raised. Yet this terminology seemed to suggest that women were all alike, rather than differentiated by class and region. The terminology also gave rise to concerns among those resistant to WID that it was a "special interest". The terminology did not seem conducive to building alliances with men for furthering the objective of people-centred development.

18. Since the late 1980s, the term "gender" has been increasingly used. Gender approaches emphasize:

(a) The social construction of male and female (as opposed to their biological distinctions);

(b) The gaps between women and men;

(c) The relations between men and women.

Gender places people at the centre, women and men. With its emphasis on how society constructs opportunities and life chances, it allows for differentiation among women and men by, for example, age or income. Some agencies have gone through the complex process of renaming their offices or of using both labels. This analysis will use the term "women/gender", given the continuing mix of language.

2. Types of approaches in agency contexts

19. The rationale for incorporating women/gender concerns into development efforts has also become more complex. Several attempts have been made to analyse the differences between approaches. One attempt focuses on five approaches, ranging from the traditional "welfare" approach to the now more common "anti-poverty", "equity", "economic", or "empowerment" approaches (Moser, 1993). Development agency staff are increasingly aware of the differences

between these approaches and the implications of the differences for how the entire development community views people and the justifications for investing in people. The empowerment rationale is becoming increasingly acceptable, leading to a shift, in some cases, to a women's empowerment framework.

20. Advocates for gender choose their language depending on the mandate of the agency in which they operate. Those working in poverty-alleviation agencies document project efficiency with targeted focus on women. The discourse of equity may not by itself be adequately persuasive in an agency of economists, while that of economic efficiency may be unsuitable in a health agency. Exemplary projects that push beyond the limitations of particular approaches, such as welfare and relief, constitute evidence of the commitment of agencies to "transformative mainstreaming".

21. Economic/efficiency justifications are the most commonly used, either by themselves or in conjunction with other approaches. Because development institutions are responsible for efficient and effective use of their resources, the economic rationale seems most consistent with agency missions and is especially effective in persuading resistant officials (Rao and others, 1991). However, a rationale based exclusively on efficiency arguments may exclude equally important equity considerations. Efficiency approaches also run the risk of failing to prove their effectiveness under the extremely short time-line of two to three years typical of most projects or the 5 to 10 years typical of most programmes. The social construction of an under-class - in this case, women - takes more than a decade to deconstruct and then to reconstruct. Its perpetuation through inaction generates costs that do not figure easily into a 2 to 10-year time frame.

3. Strategic vs. practical interests

22. In the 1990s, policy dialogue is gradually conceptualizing development in a more long-term sense. This orientation is consistent with the increased emphasis on meeting women's "strategic" as opposed to "practical" gender interests (Moser, 1993). As chapter IV will demonstrate, more and more agencies use a strategic approach to women's programming, which may yield more long-term gains for women's empowerment and may, thus, make the transformation of the mainstream of development activity more sustainable.

I. THE CULTURE OF DEVELOPMENT-ASSISTANCE INSTITUTIONS

23. This chapter focuses on the work of international agencies and the extent to which they involve women. It begins with a discussion of the types of multilateral assistance institutions included in this study. It then discusses organizational behaviour in development agencies, which are usually large bureaucratic institutions with their own distinctive "cultures". Although national Governments are outside the scope of this study, they too share the characteristics of large, bureaucratic organizations. The chapter concludes with a discussion about the limited information available on levels and type of funding for women.

A. Multilateral development institutions

24. A wide range of agencies are loosely linked under the broad organizational umbrella of the United Nations. They can be classified in a number of different ways, ranging from era of creation, to mission, to structure, and to size.

1. Era of creation: a gendered staff

25. The era of creation of an organization tells us about the demographics of its staff. United Nations agencies were born in different eras, ranging from the old and mature International Labour Organization (ILO), established in 1919 and the first to be affiliated with the United Nations, to new organizations established in the 1970s, at the height of concern about poverty alleviation in the context of wide global disparities. Most organizations were founded well before the idea of women in development was known.

26. Only one organization, UNIFEM, was created with the specific mandate of integrating women into development. It is comparatively minuscule in terms of staff and resources. Yet it is the largest critical mass in the United Nations of specialists working at the operational level in this field, and it works in coordination with other United Nations organizations, national Governments, and women's non-governmental organizations. As official histories document, UNIFEM too underwent a move towards mainstreaming in the late 1980s (Anderson, 1990 and 1993).

27. On the whole, United Nations agencies were created before WID was even an idea, much less a concept familiar to staff. Senior decision makers and most professionals then - as now - were primarily men. They were trained in disciplines and in eras in which much of women's work was invisible and unevenly counted.

28. Today, some disciplines still give little analytical attention to women. Economic analysis, on the one hand, is still largely based on paid work in the formal sector, which makes men appear more prominent. Macro-policy analysis is only recently beginning to integrate gender. On the other hand, analysis in the fields of population, health and education has long been based on gender-disaggregated data. While such data may mask the unique needs of men and women - an issue women/gender advocates strive to uncover - gender gaps are routinely reported and analysed.

(a) Increasing women's proportional representation

29. Successive goals have resulted in increased proportions of female professionals. The United Nations 1995 goal is 35 per cent, with some agencies still working to achieve the goal, and others having surpassed it. But will more women professionals make institutions more responsive to women?

30. There are good reasons to believe that more women professionals will result in better programming for women. For one, most women/gender advocates are female. For another, most professionals with training and experience in WID are women. But women are not all alike; nor are men. It can also not be assumed

that women will automatically work for women. Women are trained in different fields, only some of which call attention to gender issues.

31. The infamous "bureaucratic resistance to women's programmes", said to have characterized the late 1970s and early 1980s, is no longer as universal as it once seemed. Although agencies were once thought of as generally resistant to WID, this resistance can be broken down into several responses. One study of two United Nations organizations (Lotherington, 1991) identifies a gender-neutral typology which helps clarify responses to WID as follows:

(a) Innovators (mostly women);

(b) Loyal bureaucrats (mostly men who work in response to policies and signals);

(c) Hesitators (mostly men who are more comfortable with welfare approaches);

(d) Hard-liners (nearly always men who feel threatened and who may relate their orientation to personal attitudes towards women).

The inertia of the "loyal bureaucrat" and the "hesitator" are obstacles which can be overcome.

(b) Dynamics of proportional underrepresentation

32. A lone woman, or several women who constitute a minuscule percentage of professionals in a bureaucratic unit, cannot effectively work in a male-dominated setting without extraordinary performance pressures (Kanter, 1993). Lone women professionals leading advocacy offices or serving as focal points in technical or country units face numerous dynamics which complicate their work, only one of which is the new policy issue they advocate. Among these are the burden of representing all women, heightened gender boundaries and treatment as a female caricature. Therefore, experts recommend hiring strategies to reach a critical mass, or more minimally, hiring and placing women in "batches" rather than as lone pioneers.

(c) Male allies

33. More and more, men have become important allies in development agencies. The lead authors in UNICEF's two-volume Adjustment with a Human Face and UNDP's annual Human Development Report demonstrate the broader base of interest and expertise, which crosses gender lines. Some male executives now frequently include gender concerns in statements to staff and to the public. The advancement of the gender agenda would not have been possible without male allies.

2. Institutional mission

34. United Nations organizations can be categorized as sectoral, financial, humanitarian, or standard-setting. Sectoral agencies can be further broken down according to their primary missions of agriculture, health, industry, population, and so on.

35. The central mandate of an agency drives the type of specialized staff who are recruited. Financial institutions are likely to recruit economists for their technical core staff. The justifications that persuade economists are based on efficiency arguments. The lens through which economists view the world tends to reduce the visibility of women's unpaid work. On the other hand, the interventions they suggest may enhance overall productivity but may increase women's burden of unpaid work. This does not mean that financial institutions are intractable. Rather, it means that successful women/gender advocacy will draw on these terminologies, justifications, and documentation.

36. It is difficult to draw sharp lines that separate agencies by their missions. Agencies have overlapping missions and even fund one another for some activities. The work of humanitarian or population agencies expands into development activities, for more long-term support. Financial institutions have begun to document the rates of return on social-sector investments, such as those for girls' education. Agricultural agencies may concern themselves with legal issues, such as more gender-equitable land laws. During the 1990s, moreover, the mandates of many agencies are converging over cross-sectoral issues such as human development, environmental sustainability and, to a lesser extent, gender. Still, their core missions remain the technical ones for which they were founded, furthered by staff with the relevant technical expertise. The effectiveness of women/gender advocates depends upon the extent they connect with the core mandates of their agencies.

3. Governance structures

37. Although loosely joined with others under the United Nations umbrella, each agency has its own distinctive governance and management structure. Although these multinational and multicultural bodies have appointment policies for greater geographical representation, gender perspectives still do not characterize their decision-making processes. The accountability of multilateral bodies to ordinary people, constituents and users is complex and indirect, being linked through their interaction with national Governments.

38. United Nations development institutions are bureaucracies more than democracies. Unlike bilateral assistance institutions, they are hierarchies which are not set in political contexts through which voters hold decision makers regularly accountable through periodic electoral review (Jahan, 1992). However, United Nations agencies have the advantage of being able to move beyond the foreign policy and commercial agendas that sometimes drive bilateral interventions.

(a) National sovereignty

39. Ideally, the work of United Nations agencies is based on respect for national sovereignty. National Governments establish the framework in which United Nations agencies collaborate. However, since women's representation in national Governments around the world is negligible, gender may not be considered sufficiently important in national policies.

40. Respect for national sovereignty may be undermined in several ways, independent of work on women/gender. Financial agencies, for example, may set conditions for policy reform before monetary transfers are made. Regulations may specify accountancy, planning, and evaluation standards. Substantive standards for the promotion of human rights, environment or labour law, and equity also nudge at the principle of respect for national sovereignty.

(b) Centralization/decentralization

41. United Nations agencies range from centralized agencies with most staff at headquarters to those with decentralized staff and lines of authority. In centralized agencies, management faces fewer intra-organizational communication problems than in organizations with several field offices around the world. Decentralized structures, on the other hand, offer staff the opportunity for acquiring fuller expertise and greater contact with national Governments and non-governmental organizations. Some United Nations agencies have country-based programming cycles relying on information acquired by their field offices. Yet for decentralized organizations, headquarters/field communication is problematic, potentially worsening their fragmentation. As one study (Pietila and Eide, 1990) indicates, in such agencies:

> Field office staff tend to complain about being overloaded, leaving them too little time to reflect, learn, see new opportunities - and to adapt and implement new policy signals from central United Nations offices...[The organization's] main counterpart at the level of government is likely to be the Ministry of Finance or Planning, which is politically and professionally less inclined to be prepared for a discussion of WID issues.

42. Just as United Nations organizations are not a monolithic group, by criteria of age, mission, size, or structure, so also are national governmental ministries not a monolithic group. Different United Nations agencies work with different ministries, where notions about the "cultural suitability" of working with women may vary. Yet without significant coordination, opportunities may go unseized, even at the country level.

43. Through resolutions passed in various United Nations conferences, various agencies and national Governments may be stimulated to draw up action plans for women. Action by the United Nations General Assembly also can stimulate new policy initiatives. The WID group of the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) in the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) established guiding principles in 1983 (revised in 1989) for monitoring progress in the implementation of its gender policies. Its reports provide a vehicle through which bilateral assistance agencies report and then compare women/gender actions (OECD/DAC, 1992).

4. Agency size

44. The organizations in this study also vary in terms of size, measured both by staff numbers and budgets. The demand for their resources or technical expertise and the stability of those resources create very different kinds of behaviour. Some institutions have more financial independence, while others depend on voluntary contributions. Women/gender offices are sometimes wholly or partially funded on "soft" and temporary terms, even in financially independent and sound agencies.

45. Professional staff in agencies range in number from 25 to thousands, including national and international staff. In addition, some of them employ large numbers of consultants and contractors, which may complicate efforts to communicate gender policies to all staff, both regular and temporary.

46. Bureaucracies function by recruiting specialized staff, determining a division of labour and establishing a hierarchy of control through which to supervise tasks. Problems of communication, coordination, and hierarchy tend to be greater in larger organizations. One study of United Nations organizations reports a 10-level hierarchical pyramid in the agencies (Lotherington, 1991). Hierarchy and division may constrain progress on cross-sectoral issues like women/gender. Moreover, women professionals and WID innovators are likely to staff mid- to low-levels of the hierarchy. While some critics argue that bureaucracies are incompatible with women's lives, the successful track record of WID shows that women/gender mainstreaming work can and should be strengthened.

B. Organizational culture

47. The peculiar history and culture of an organization is a determinant of institutional strategies and activities on women/gender. Organizations are not all alike. For this reason, there is no single WID approach that works in all agencies. Women/gender advocates must understand the distinctiveness of their host organizations in their attempts to advance WID concerns with limited resources and staff.

48. The concept of "organizational culture" 2/ allows people to diagnose the peculiarities of each organization and develop prescriptions for change. As Walker (1986) says, "All organizations have a particular culture composed of ideologies, rituals, myths, and knowledge of the organization, its environment, and its past". The founders of an organization establish the initial core definition of mission. They recruit professionals with particular disciplinary and ideological orientations. Professional staff either assimilate or leave, unless they create or find a niche in which to build a base for organizational change. Organizational cultures change under certain conditions, as box I.1 indicates.

Box I.1. Changing organizational cultures

1. Shifts occur in their environments, from critics, political constituencies, coalition partners, governing boards or funders, among others.

2. Subcultures confront or slowly nudge at the core mission, most effectively done in coalition with or with leverage from other internal subcultures (and occasionally external forces).

3. New or successor chief executives put in place senior staff who shift focus, reorganize, hire new or diversified (demographic or disciplinary) personnel, and redistribute resources, thereby altering the incentive system within which work is done.

4. A crisis occurs, such as performance or budget failure or a serious public-image problem, setting in motion the above forces.

49. Women/gender advocates, dissecting and diagnosing their own organizational cultures, have lived through the first condition for change, but it is an environment crowded with contradictory signals. International women's conferences and resolutions have sent clear signals to stimulate organizational change. Yet they have resulted in equally compelling signals overloading staff and forcing a prioritization that may not favour WID. An organization's women/gender unit is an example of the second condition, a subculture. Staff in such units build formal alliances with other units and through interdepartmental steering committees. Networks represent an informal link. Among the many elements of the third condition, women/gender units seize opportunities associated with new executives. Yet executives are lobbied by many parts of the organization. Even with executive-driven reorganization, much of the same personnel may remain in place, with outlooks developed through several years of socialization.

50. Box I.2 outlines the fourth condition by presenting a case-study of how one agency became responsive to environmental concerns in the context of crisis in the public image of the organization. The case is relevant since women/gender, like environment, is a cross-cutting issue. Merely the integration of women/gender into existing operations may be a challenge for some agencies. Transforming operations so that women make a qualitative difference is the next step. Gender advocates in funding agencies may combine economic efficiency approaches with those for equity and poverty alleviation and use sophisticated analytic techniques to make the case for long-term investments in gender. Their efforts may not yield benefits quickly, as box I.2 suggests. But persistence, quality, and vigilance could eventually pay off.

Box I.2. Agency response to a cross-cutting issue

A large financial institution supports development interventions. Staff in the institution are said to be subject to pressure from the top of the agency; pressure from recipient countries, as board members and as acceptors or rejectors of conditions; bureaucratic self-interest from a hardworking and competitive staff; intellectual conviction, "couched in economic terms", or "translated into economic terms" and personal conviction. Women/gender advocates diagnose these pressure points and characteristics in strategizing for change. According to studies (Lenox and McNeill, 1989), this agency responds to yet other pressures from member countries in the form of their voting shares and from international non-governmental organizations, particularly in the context of crisis in the public image of the organization.

The agency moved from a zero profile for the environment before the 1970s to high profile and procedural change by the late 1980s. Although researchers and non-governmental organizations documented how its projects were linked to environmental destruction, costs such as displacement, new diseases, and salinization were not previously figured into the cost-benefit ratios of projects with short lifespans.

International conferences in the 1970s and national laws gave visibility to the issue. The agency established an office with a handful of staff charged with developing new appraisal methods, educating staff, supplying language for sectoral policies, funding projects and institution-building in recipient countries, and coordinating efforts. Deemed irrelevant by many staff, the environmental office was ghettoized in a senior office.

Minor changes occurred, even in country policy negotiations. The agency frowned upon halting disbursement, however, on the grounds of national sovereignty. Perhaps as important, countries sought diverse funding for large projects. If the agency established too strict a set of standards, countries would turn elsewhere, and funding opportunities would be lost. Internal incentives drive staff to "move money".

Critical events during the 1980s propelled environmental momentum. The driving factor was massive rain-forest destruction, with consequences for indigenous people and the global climate, creating a public relations disaster for the agency. The agency executive acknowledged a crisis and proceeded to integrate reforms such as dramatic increases in specialist staff (assigned in operations departments) and infusion into training curricula and country reports. Some of its earlier appraisal procedural proposals were now in demand. Yet environmental integration did not change the mainstream of this agency in qualitative ways.

51. More needs to be known about organizational cultures, for there is no "one best way" for women/gender advocates to pursue their mainstreaming strategies. More information about organization cultures in sectoral or poverty-alleviation agencies would lead to better diagnoses and prescriptions. For example, staff trained in sociology and anthropology may bring complementary perspectives to those of economists. In addition gender-disaggregated analysis must be linked to the agency's central mission and to higher performance.

C. Level and percentage of funding directed to women

52. United Nations development institutions ultimately affect people, male and female. This impact should be considered when evaluating programme outcomes. Institutions should be able to compare achievements and targeted goals, both over time and to other institutions. Without knowledge of women's participation in programmes and projects or of investments in women measured in funding terms, it is difficult to assess what strategies are, in fact, effective for mainstreaming gender in particular organizational cultures.

53. Unfortunately, serious evaluation of people-based outcomes that goes beyond accountancy, is a relatively underdeveloped feature. No standardized format exists across United Nations agencies for reporting gender-disaggregated data so they can measure their progress over time and compare themselves to other agencies. Gender-disaggregated budgeting, monitoring and evaluation represent a major challenge to policies and projects designed on the assumption that everyone in a household benefits from development projects, male and female alike.

1. Beyond women-specific projects and funds

54. Women's activities usually fall in the category of "women-specific projects", generally small and not necessarily linked to mainstream institutional spending. The budgetary resources placed at the disposal of women/gender offices are also usually very small. If anything, details of such budgetary outlays probably underestimate women's participation in, and agency spending on, development outcomes. If institutions are to take mainstreaming seriously, evaluation offices must document women's participation beyond women-specific programming. If little or no participation or documentation exists, action may be driven by a crisis such as that discussed in box I.2.

55. Women-specific projects usually constitute a minuscule percentage of total projects, whether assessed as a proportion of total projects or of total funds disbursed. Women's projects are easy to identify but perhaps more limited in impact. If gender-based activities are restricted to such projects, the challenge to measure women's involvement in mainstream projects goes unrealized.

2. Underdeveloped mainstream indicators

56. The level of activities and/or percentage of resources directed to women is difficult to measure. The definition of women-centred programming may itself be

unclear across internal agency lines, with different units presenting different data. Figures such as the percentage of projects incorporating action on women, WID analytic work or the percentage of funding of the advocacy unit compared to all funding are sometimes furnished, but such figures do not indicate how much money is allocated to women or to activities in which women share outcomes. External evaluations can be a source of information on the level and nature of funding on gender. Such evaluations have sometimes found that large shares of the resources reported are spent on service delivery and materials. While the numbers of staff deployed for or trained in gender are more easily counted and measured, this too does not represent the whole picture of an agency's resource allocation for gender.

57. Moreover, analysis and action are not the same. What is proposed in project design or country analysis will translate to implementation and outcomes only with suitable systems to sustain the momentum. Such incentives include establishing monitorable indicators for reporting in evaluations.

58. Discrepancies may also exist between women's visibility in documents and action in the field. Monitoring such discrepancies through instruments such as discrepancy reports or bar graphs may be useful. Such charts can trace the process of the "fadeout", or gradual marginalization, of gender through the project cycle, from the analysis stage to the stages of strategy design, action and outcomes.

D. Towards consistent mainstream indicators

59. Some attempts have been made to categorize projects according to their incorporation of women and women's interests (Kardam, 1991). Such categorization represents a start, but more standardized annual reporting on this and budgetary information is required. The move away from project to programme and policy funding is likely to make this task more difficult.

60. With or without moves towards policy funding, existing budget categories are not always amenable to people-oriented breakdowns. The traditional classification of expenditures by personnel, training, subcontracts, and miscellaneous items is obscure and needs to be replaced by more transparent categories. In fact, present indicators are still too crude adequately to assess the people-based and gender-based outcomes of development activities. Most agencies continue to have low funding levels for women.

61. Categories such as the following may be useful in assessing the gender-based impact of development interventions:

(a) Women-integrated programmes and projects;

(b) WID-relevant programmes;

(c) WID-specific programmes and projects;

(d) National capacity-building in WID.

62. Since 1990, 11 members of the OECD/DAC have been using a statistical method, the creditor reporting system, to report disbursements for what they call "WID-specific" and "WID-integrated" activities. The methodology has the double objective of serving as a tool for statistical reporting, and serving as an instrument for raising awareness about women in development. The central principle of the methodology is registration of the total amount of a project in statistical reports if certain criteria are met. On the creditor reporting form, to be filled out for each project, there is room to indicate whether a project is WID-specific or WID-integrated. This new system helps to ensure that WID issues are introduced at the design and implementation stages, where consideration of WID is most often neglected and which in turn contributes substantially to inappropriate attention to WID during the entire project cycle (OECD/DAC, 1993). This methodology has introduced important elements for policy and implementation. Five other members planned to introduce the methodology when the report was written. Other agencies should examine the strengths and inadequacies of this innovative system and consider adopting a similar mechanism or collaborating with one another to develop an appropriate system.

63. In future, a refined set of indicators for evaluation should distinguish between various approaches, from welfare to equity, to efficiency and empowerment, and between interventions for furthering practical gender needs and those for furthering strategic gender needs. Social analysis and evaluation units could make the qualitative difference in better documenting such outcomes. Until resource reporting exists on a routine basis, little will be understood about agency action beyond stated policy and process. Women/gender offices need the leverage that such financial accountability would provide.

E. Summary

64. This chapter set the organizational contexts for analyses of United Nations agencies and their gender-mainstreaming work. It established the general patterns that differentiate agencies, including their era of creation, missions, structures and sizes. Because of these differences, women/gender advocates pursue diverse strategies in their efforts to integrate gender into the mainstream of their home agencies.

65. The chapter called attention to organizational complexities in strategic planning. The percentage of women professionals is increasing - a positive step. But women alone cannot shoulder the responsibility for mainstreaming gender, nor do all women seek to work on this issue. Men must share this responsibility if agency policies are to be implemented and effectiveness is to increase.

66. Organizational culture is a useful concept for diagnosing and planning for change. This chapter used the case-study of the organizational culture in one agency for identifying mainstreaming strategies for a parallel cross-sectoral issue (environmental sustainability). The pressure points, organizationally specific ideologies and staff orientations seen in the case-study provide insight into the conditions under which change occurs.

67. The chapter concluded by pointing out the paucity of information about projects that respond to women, both in separate and integrated ways, and about funding directed towards women. Information about people-oriented results is also lacking, an obstacle which hinders gender-accountable mainstreaming. Even though institutions are diverse in mission, size, and other factors, simple and consistent United Nations system-wide standards must be developed for reporting outcomes.

II. INSTITUTIONAL STRATEGIES

68. Most development institutions had or have a women/gender unit. This chapter focuses on their institutional strategies. It first compares structural locations and then moves on to policy documents. It compares staffing strategies that range from training existing staff to recruiting more women professionals. Most agencies also support formal or informal networking to build, sustain, and increase allies within organizations. The chapter closes with a discussion on evaluation.

A. Internal structures

69. Advocacy units vary considerably in terms of the structures and strategic locations from which they work to transform agencies. The most common structure involves a centralized unit, in which the women/gender unit reports to a senior administrator and links to focal points in functional (sector) and geographical (regional) units at headquarters and sometimes in the "field" of world regions and countries. The amount of time devoted to gender by staff in focal points ranges from full-time to part-time to "being volunteered" for an extra responsibility: to monitor WID in the unit. If she is the lone women/gender person, it is reasonable to expect some of the dynamics of proportional underrepresentation to operate, as discussed in chapter I.

70. Agencies rely on single or multiple models for operationalizing women/gender. A single package model aims for consistent standards across the agency. It has the potential advantage of being able to set high expectations and then to achieve and monitor the results. Its disadvantages stem from the resistance of regional and operational staff who may not share in the definition and ownership of the package. Such resistance is typically articulated by characterizing gender-sensitive efforts as "irrelevant" or "culturally incompatible".

71. Under the multiple model, an agency asks the functional/geographical units to define and label women/gender position(s), thereby providing them with co-ownership and stake in the issue. Several agencies have dismantled the central women/gender unit, replacing it with interdepartment task forces or a gender team. Before introducing such a model, it is crucial to have strong operational expertise and commitment to gender. If introduced prematurely, gender policy could dissipate into the regional/technical relativism that legitimizes inaction.

1. Historical lessons

72. In pioneering WID agencies, women/gender advocacy was situated near the top of the agency pyramid, at headquarters rather than in the field. To be in or near the chief executive's office conferred legitimacy and visibility. Such positioning also served the public relations concerns of agencies eager to demonstrate that "something was being done" at the beginning of the United Nations Decade for Women. Quickly, however, advocates discovered the necessity to move towards technical operations in policy-making, programme and project

design and implementation. Yet women/gender is a cross-sectoral issue, struggling in sectoral-based bureaucracies.

73. In other settings, women's units grew out of home economics, a separate unit of earlier vintage. This, however, institutionalized the traditional ideologies of the gender division of labour, which keeps women's productive work largely invisible. It was not until the field of home economics began undergoing its own metamorphosis that this limitation was somewhat rectified.

2. Size, strength and authority

74. Women/gender units range in size from one to a dozen professionals in mainstream agencies. None has a budget of more than several million dollars (most have far less) in multibillion dollar mainstream agencies. None has been empowered to halt disbursements or penalize staff for inattention to women/gender policy. Such authority rests with line managers who only unevenly enforce the many procedural guidelines which have been put into place for women/gender.

75. Thus, women/gender units rely on persuasion, studies, expertise, training, unevenly enforced procedures, and leveraged resources to integrate or transform gender into mainstream efforts. In no case does this imply significant power, authority, or leverage to transform agencies. The agencies studied range from small organizations of less than 100 to those with more than 5,000 staff. Added to these staff are numerous consultants, whose connection with and knowledge of agency policies can be more tenuous than those of regular staff.

76. Consequently, it is incumbent upon women/gender units to use strategically the expertise, procedures, accountability mechanisms, and agency ideology/policy as leverage and tools so that the better endowed parts of the agency can pursue their mission in a gender-transformed way.

3. Natural allies

77. Under these conditions of minimal budgets, staff, and authority, alliance-building strategies can help to engage other units and spread interest and responsibility. This strategic activity is no easy task in large, highly compartmentalized bureaucracies.

78. In several agencies, alliance-building is formalized through the interdepartmental/division working or steering group comprised of senior officials or their representatives. Such structures designate responsibility to more than women/gender units. In a reversed pattern, women/gender staff are appointed to mainstream committees, such as those entrusted with senior appointments. Management thereby sends a legitimizing message to other committee members and provides opportune space for women/gender advocacy to occur.

79. Mutually beneficial alliances can maximize the quality of outcomes for the whole agency. Successful interchange can occur, for example, between the

women/gender unit and the forestry unit of an agency for taking up community-based forestry activities. In the health field, the inclusion of more strategic gender issues can both help in, and be helped by, the widening of the core agenda of an agency.

80. Periodic international meetings create opportunities to build alliances within and across organizational boundaries. In mainstream and cross-sectoral international conferences, gender-responsive resolutions provide the wedge for alliance-building, co-ownership, and resource sharing in such areas as human rights, democracy, non-governmental organization advocacy, and good governance; environmental sustainability (under the alliance-centred acronym, WED, for "women in environmentally sustainable development"); agrarian reform and rural development; and community health.

81. International initiatives in mainstream or cross-sectoral issues provide sector staff with an incentive to seek assistance from a women/gender unit in order to respond in a quality, comprehensive way. When women/gender issues are integrated into international resolutions, studies, and non-governmental organization advocacy, the process educates and stimulates the "hesitator" or "loyal bureaucrat" staff (to use the terminology of chapter I) to seek advice for a new approach legitimized via sources other than the women/gender unit.

82. The recent concept of "human development" constitutes a rationale for long-term investments in people, including women. This idea has received impetus through UNDP's annual Human Development Reports in which women/gender issues are woven throughout the narrative and tables. As the human development index (HDI) shows, a country's development ranking may be dramatically altered when adjusted for gender. The reports highlight women's strategic interests, such as the reduction and elimination of women-specific violence, though only a minority of countries collect and report such data. However, at present there is little evidence that human development is the prime strategy.

B. Policy documents

83. Policies provide an opportunity to conduct a dialogue over the form, justification and future of women/gender in an agency. They legitimize change and help resocialize staff (perhaps the loyal bureaucrats, quick to respond to cues rather than those who wait for "requirements"). More important is the extent to which policies are communicated and infused into procedures and operations.

84. In the normal sequence of activities, the women/gender unit develops a policy statement or guidelines which can then promote action in the form of procedural change, data collection, research, project design and training. Document numbers in specific agencies range from one to 14. Over time, they generally increase in specificity on operations. Frequently, boards create or endorse these documents, adding legitimacy and leverage to what can be done with the document.

85. The lack of a gender policy need not hinder activity in the women/gender area. Agencies may, in some cases, decide to gain analytic and operational

experience before going through the process of formulating a policy document. Agency chief executives may meanwhile help establish the principle that attention to women/gender is necessary; gender units can then periodically refer to these remarks for institutionally legitimizing their efforts. However, more than executive speech-making may be ultimately necessary to convince operational staff that women/gender meshes with the central mandate of the agency.

86. On the other hand, even with WID guidelines in place, gender may still occupy a marginal place in agency activities. Although ways to categorize projects in terms of the integration of women may be clarified, such data may not be easily accessible or reported. Thus, there is no necessary, sequential relationship between policy and action.

C. Procedures and process

87. Agencies use a variety of common procedures, some of which were initiated as far back as the 1970s. These include mandating gender-disaggregated data; generating checklists and guidelines for the project design and preparation process; producing and disseminating materials on how gender fits into the technical mandate of the agency; and preparing operational guidelines on how staff can make that fit real in programmes and projects. Operational guidelines have been developed in some cases for gender analysis in project formulation in core sectors, with practical tools for diagnosing, assessing, investigating, and analysing. Several agencies also now generate gender-disaggregated data, but those data need to be strategically used in evaluating and assessing outcomes.

88. A small women/gender unit in a large agency may face the dilemma that the extensive paperwork associated with guidelines compliance may not even be read. If technical staff themselves do not learn from the procedure and repeatedly sidestep full response, the women/gender unit may be doubly burdened. Box II.1 describes a user-friendly form in a three-page format, developed to invite technical staff to engage with the gender staff, while simultaneously sending cues to them. Such forms are far less intimidating than lengthy checklists on gender.

89. Women/gender staff have developed other techniques. One strategy is to decentralize and spread expertise through focal points and gender-sensitive consultants. Rosters of these experts are often maintained. Women/gender units sometimes pay, wholly or in part, for such consultants. Some have learned that other units value WID experts' work more when they pay for it themselves or contribute a share.

Box II.1. User-friendly sectoral form

I. General considerations

1. Please state significant steps taken to incorporate women as contributors to and beneficiaries of the project. Are women's needs and concerns reflected in the project objectives, project outputs, and project activities?

2. Have women's organizations or organizations that promote the advancement of women been involved in project planning and formulation? Explain the extent of their participation.

3. How will the project strengthen the capability of existing institutions to facilitate women's future participation in sector and development programmes?

II. Specific information regarding women as project participants and beneficiaries and on the gender dimensions of data inputs, monitoring and evaluation

1. Are women direct participants in project activities? Please explain steps taken to encourage more active roles for women and note any factors that might impede their participation.

2. Are women involved as key decision makers or managers of project activities? Please describe the decision-making or management roles they will undertake, noting any factors that might impede this role.

3. Are women the direct or indirect beneficiaries of project activities? How will they benefit? Indicate any factors that may impede women's access to the benefits of the project.

4. Please indicate the gender breakdown of those involved in the project as:

Project experts Consultants Trainees

5. In preparing this project, were gender-disaggregated background data available? Please indicate the type of data and sources utilized.

6. Does the monitoring and evaluation mechanism provide for the assessment of the project impact on women? How?

III. Other comments/observations

Any additional thoughts you have would be welcome.

Thanks for completing this form!

D. Gender training

90. In the 1980s, when many agencies shifted from women-specific to mainstreaming approaches, advocates worked to develop gender training for male and female staff. Training usually consists of short, two-to-three day courses and hands-on learning techniques that provide a framework into which staff can plug their post-training work tasks.

91. Several training approaches are utilized. In the Harvard case approach, most relevant for project design and evaluation, a gender analysis is conducted of work, resources and control structures, with specific case materials. In the gender planning model, whole institutions and their missions are diagnosed. In a grassroots model, such as the Peasant Women's Summits supported by UNIFEM in South Asia, rural dwellers train planners, policy makers, and other staff. Yet another model engages staff to confront the personal prejudices they may hold about women.

92. The 1991 conference on gender training, held in Bergen, Norway, showcased a variety of successful gender-training experiences. Two of them included bilateral agencies considered to be institutional success stories at the time - Canada and Sweden - which mandated gender training for their staff (Rao and others, 1991).

1. Positive training experiences

93. The majority of agencies compared in this report stress gender training as a strategic tool, in current and future plans. Typically, training is a two-stage affair: in the first, a generic package is used to educate staff in gender approaches; in the second, agency staff ground this training in operationally specific and concrete terms, using their own cases. In agencies where gender training is institutionalized, trainees generally view it favourably. However, good training is costly.

94. Some promising gender-training programmes for agencies and government staff in various development sectors involve country-based women/gender trainers. UNIFEM has organized region-based sessions, co-sponsored by or in collaboration with country and regional institutions. In one, co-sponsored by the African Development Bank, senior bureaucrats considered gender training in their institutions. In another, it supported a national agrarian research institute to design and implement gender training for governmental and non-governmental organizations (Anderson, 1993).

95. The concept of people-oriented planning is sometimes used to accomplish the goal of gender training. "People-driven programming builds stakes and diminishes the anxieties some staff seem to have with the discourse of women/gender. Staff tend to view it as efficient, common-sensical programming, rather than the "cultural intervention" still evoked by some about women/gender. When gender training is conducted in-country, governmental officials are usually not just supportive but enthusiastic about the approach.

96. Socio-economic and gender analysis (SEGA) training programmes constitute a recent initiative in some agencies. The SEGA approach aims to increase national and United Nations capacity to apply socio-economic and gender analysis to formulating gender-responsive, pro-poor, and environmentally and socially sustainable projects and programmes. It also aims to increase the number of indigenous trainers. Like the "people-driven" model above, this strategy permits the alliance of people-oriented forces to work with gender, without losing visibility for the latter. Combining forces is also a cost-effective strategy for units that chronically lack resources. Coordinated efforts are valuable but difficult to achieve with different agency cultures, philosophies, technical languages, and time-frames.

2. Rethinking gender training

97. In terms of the four categories of staff discussed in the chapter above, "loyal bureaucrats" and "hesitators" may benefit most from training. "Innovators" probably do not need training. "Resistors" likely need far more than a few days training to unearth the difficulties they have with women/gender work. The proportional representation of these kinds of staff will vary with organizational culture, particularly the background preparation that differs, for example, between health and agricultural staff.

98. Gender training is increasingly being institutionalized. Although considered useful in several agencies and academic settings, some such training is being reduced by agencies, out of a perception that it has diminishing returns. Managers are sometimes reluctant to release male staff for training, or if released, staff may be recalled before the training is completed. Elsewhere, training is now reaching the hard core resistant staff, who are the least likely to learn from the experience and may create a backlash.

3. Mainstreaming gender training

99. With these sorts of difficulties, it is all the more important to plan strategically for integration into regular training activities. Such incorporation is key to successful alliance-building. From the 1991 gender training conference in Bergen, several of the United Nations agencies analysed herein report some incorporation in their mainstream training institutes, estimated to occupy 5-25 per cent of training time. A few agencies are now considering ways to link gender with cultural sensitivity training for managers. Successful examples link gender training with people-oriented concerns. The more that technical staff build such concerns into their work, the better development is likely to be.

100. Training can be tied to personnel accountability strategies, including those incentives and penalties to which staff respond in their work. Mandating staff training and rewarding training or recognizing its reflection in improved work through personnel evaluations can promote staff receptivity to gender training.

101. Accountability strategies must be stretched to include consultants, who are responsible for much work in the field. Agencies face chronic difficulties dealing with untrained contractors who implement projects. To respond, some women/gender units provide rosters of consultants knowledgeable and experienced in gender work.

102. Trainees' behaviour does not change in unsupportive work contexts. Two days of training cannot undo lifetimes of gender stereotyped ideology. Trainees should be required to develop plans of work during training. Thereafter, a supportive post-training context is crucial for putting training into practice. Likewise, gender training should be linked to tasks, projects, and follow-up to assess behavioral outcomes.

E. More women professionals

103. United Nations agencies regularly collect data on the breakdown of male and female professionals they employ. While project/programme accountability measures are still underdeveloped, personnel offices can provide data on equal employment opportunity (EEO). Although levels are categorized in different ways, most agencies have good data on the percentage of women professionals at top and midlevels, and in headquarters and in regional and country-level offices. Such reporting can potentially assist in laying down and monitoring targets.

1. Unmet United Nations equal employment opportunity targets

104. Just a few agencies studied in this report employ females as a third of their professionals. Women are always less well represented at the highest levels, although several United Nations agencies are female-headed. In the agencies studied, women professionals are virtually always less well represented in the field of regional and country offices. Such underrepresentation does not bode well for action on women/gender in those agencies where country programming represents the central focus of operations, if women are the only advocates. For professional couples, headquarters locations may offer more opportunities for spouses.

2. Making male staff responsible for gender

105. Questions and analyses about EEO assume that women are more likely to support women/gender programming. Those who work in agencies sometimes question those assumptions. Neither men nor women are monolithic in their support for, or resistance to, women/gender programming. If responsibilities for women/gender programming fall solely on women's shoulders, then mainstreaming will take generations to achieve.

106. Women/gender units in several agencies have positioned male gender experts in strategic locations. Personnel decisions like this help underline the point that the unit addresses quality, comprehensive programming and more than EEO goals. Moreover, men allies have been crucial in several agencies which have

moved far in mainstreaming women/gender concerns. Examples include (male) chief executives and authors of high-visibility reports.

107. Personnel procedures can signal, recognize and reward action on women/gender. Personnel evaluations and career ladders are ways to encourage staff. Even women staff may distance themselves from WID, without a promising career ladder (Himmelstrand, 1990). Commendation letters can be issued for positive action on EEO. The same could be done on mainstreaming women/gender in projects and programmes. In personnel evaluation forms, cues can be inserted for promoting action on women/gender. Such cues, where they exist, may not change behaviour significantly without institutional commitment. For example, obtaining reports from staff about the inclusion of women/gender in a project and then regularly tolerating the routine response of "irrelevant" will send contradictory messages.

3. Linking EEO and multidisciplinary hiring to mainstreaming

108. Those agencies with more women appear to have moved further in mainstreaming gender. To some extent, this positive profile relates to agency missions, such as health, women, or population. Staff balancing strategies are long-term in nature, involving academic training and affirmative action.

109. Strategic plans to increase female representation require multiple, long-term strategies. The gender focal point in one agency sponsored work force assessments that showed "supply/demand" budgetary gaps amounting to a third of a million dollars, in addition to the annual training budgetary requirement. The analysis led to the formulation of a strategy which supports female training "fellow"ships, educates staff visually through posters, promotes gender-neutral language, develops on-the-job training, facilitates women's networks, and prints career guides. This comprehensive EEO strategy was developed in a particularly challenging environment. The strategy builds a database that is central to agency mission and future health.

110. Agencies with the best EEO record are those with health and population missions. Yet health agencies face other personnel challenges: medical doctors sometimes establish a hierarchical distance between themselves and other professional staff. Such challenges are equally problematic for other agencies in view of their gender imbalance.

111. Both the training and EEO sections of this report call attention to the long-term preparation of women and professionals with women/gender expertise in their pre-institutional life, that is during their university education. Far more complex gender analysis is possible in semester-long course work and major programs than workshops. Some strategies have been developed in response. For example, the agricultural extension curriculum in training institutions can be reviewed for its gender content. Diversifying the skill mix of staff by including gender experts can enrich the work of an organization. As more agencies recruit staff with WID expertise, demand will be created for "gendered" curricula in academia, which is the primary source of pre-institutional training for most United Nations professionals.

F. Networking with agency personnel

112. Networking is a strategy to build allies and to disseminate information about successful and not-so-successful efforts. Many agencies support networking through formal and informal means. Several examples below demonstrate the creativity used to build connections between staff over women/gender.

1. Internal networking

113. Agencies disseminate information on women/gender in mainstream newsletters and house journals. For example, a WID/Link newsletter disseminates innovations to readers in one agency. Another institution is home to an informal network, the Action Group for Equality, with an in-house newsletter, dealing not just with gender but with all types of equality issues. An internal network called "Fifty-Fifty" has been created in one organization for dialogue, reading material, and videos. Another organization maintains a phone list and organizational chart of its formal and informal connections. The catchy acronym GAP (gender and poverty) distinguishes an informal group in another agency. Several agencies have renamed their networking efforts to make them more inclusive of men and women.

2. External networking

114. External networking occurs in those agencies with the mandate of connecting with non-governmental organizations at the international and national levels. For example, reports may be commissioned to link human rights with the sectoral mandate of an agency. Health agencies are particularly well-networked with international non-governmental organizations.

115. As agencies move increasingly into country programming and interaction with national advocacy strategies, local women and women-friendly organizations must be included in dialogue on gender-sensitive policy-making. A number of United Nations agencies have established good, strong precedents for this dialogue and participation. Increasingly, mainstream documents emphasize democracy and good governance. Human Development Report 1993, for example, focuses on people's participation, including women's participation.

G. Evaluation

116. Evaluation procedures provide signals to and incentives for data collection during projects and programmes that have the potential to document gender in development outcomes. Such signals and incentives affect implementation processes for managers.

117. Many agencies now recognize the need for "monitorable indicators" during the design phases of development work. However, the design phase, on which women/gender units have concentrated much attention, has not always been linked to the implementation and evaluation phases. Terms of reference do not

routinely include WID issues. Evaluation reports may not assess the degree and quality of women's involvement. In part, this is due to the fragmented work process in bureaucratic agencies.

118. Strategically, both design and evaluation are linked. Data must be categorized and collected on the degree to which gender is relevant, included, and/or integrated into projects. Gender indicators should be threaded throughout evaluation guidelines, and software developed to report regularly on agency action regarding gender. In most agencies, gender-disaggregated data requirements have finally sunk into procedures. Now it is up to the agencies to stimulate the strategic use of these data.

119. The responsibility for ensuring this rests with the evaluation units, which should be empowered to establish accountability for the human development successes and failures of their agencies. To do so, more people-oriented indicators, presently sorely lacking in many development institutions, need to be developed.

120. Conditions exist to assess outcomes on gender within and across agencies. Inter-agency collaborations on evaluation offer a setting in which to dialogue over the appropriate indicators and measures of outcomes and to report findings. Evaluation units have a stake in documenting outcomes and impacts, from which lessons can be learned and then fed into future programme and project design. As such, evaluation represents strategic leverage for women/gender units.

H. Conclusions

121. What do these strategies tell us about agency-wide accountability for accomplishing gender-balanced outcomes or documentable results on women/gender policies? We know that after many years of effort, conditions are in place to use data collection, design procedures, personnel policies, training, networks, and evaluation procedures to spread responsibility from the typically small women/gender office to the entire agency, where that responsibility belongs.

122. With planning, design, and gender-disaggregated data requirements now in place, advocates should seize the opportunity to connect these to evaluation activity. Evaluation units have the potential to connect outcomes with individual and agency-wide accountability. The units can produce analysis that will draw lessons for programme/project improvement. Reports on women/gender should emanate from evaluation offices, while continuing to support operational and technical units that generate data, research and studies relevant to women/gender.

123. Accountability is linked both to monitoring and evaluation procedures that provide relevant information on people-oriented outcomes and the quality of programmes generally. One strategy is to include women/gender experts on monitoring and evaluation teams. Much still remains to be done to establish agency-wide accountability and for documenting behaviour and outcomes that are responsive to women as well as men. Cases from the field show just what can be accomplished, as chapter III outlines.

III. CASES FROM THE FIELD

124. Technical assistance is ultimately meaningful only if programmes and projects begin to become accountable to women. While we do not have good information on the extent to which agencies include women or on results that benefit women, we do now have a track record of more and less successful projects and programmes.

125. This chapter examines cases of projects and programmes in three different ways. First, government action towards women is examined within institutions and between institutions and women's groups. Secondly, successful and less successful projects are compared in the framework of targeting versus mainstreaming approaches. Few detailed examples of successful mainstream projects are reported in United Nations agencies. Finally, successful and less successful projects are considered in terms of meeting women's practical versus strategic gender needs.

A. Government commitment

126. Detailed information about governmental actions which facilitate more or less successful response is extremely limited. While countries now widely have a women's machinery, women's sections of political parties, women's or women-friendly non-governmental organizations, and/or support for CEDAW, little is known about the degree to which gender is central to the efforts of mainstream government ministries and departments.

127. Government ministries and departments match the diversity of the United Nations agencies in this study. They have distinctive missions, cultures, and operating styles, which are not necessarily responsive to the voices of peoples or non-governmental organizations generally. On the whole, decision-making inside bureaucracy is relatively closed to outsiders' eyes. Several national Governments have created institutional structures responsible for WID policies and projects in the form of "women's machineries". Whether they are separate from or part of ministries/departments in various Governments, women's machineries are typically units with low budgets and limited staff that are expected to transform a whole institution, or in some cases a whole Government. Similar choices, strategies, and obstacles confront such machineries. Like the women/gender units in agencies, they need support from other staff and resources to integrate or mainstream gender. The existence of these women-specific structures may inadvertently contribute to the side-lining rather than the mainstreaming of women/gender into operations. However, separate women/gender units are compatible with effective mainstreaming. Their effectiveness depends on the institutional strategy and their placement in the hierarchy as well as on their technical competence.

128. The cases below, presented in boxes, illustrate examples of successful and unsuccessful mainstreaming. The first case comes from a published source. Including such internal institutional strategies in the documentation of activities by United Nations agencies would be quite useful for drawing lessons for future applications. The second case, while unsuccessful, demonstrates the

potentials of linkage between women-specific programming in relation to mainstreaming activities.

129. What we learn from the case in Box III.1 resembles the effective institutional strategies pursued in agencies, as outlined in chapter II. First, the women's advocate built a new idea around existing institutional missions and structures, making those missions more efficient and effective. Not coincidentally, ministry effectiveness would also empower women economically and politically. Secondly, she developed allies, including strategically placed men (both innovators and loyal bureaucrats), who soon realized that these new efforts would enhance their own career success. Thirdly, she set meaningful targets (50 per cent), along with a monitoring system that would document progress. Periodic reports of limited goal achievement (40 per cent) could then be used to stimulate stronger efforts. The second and third points demonstrate a use of personnel and evaluation accountability mechanisms. Finally, for this regional effort to scale up and outward to the rest of the country, networks have been developed with advocacy organizations and senior officials. As all these points show, women farmers and advocates work with men and together share the ownership of this new initiative.

Box III.1 Successful mainstreaming in a Ministry of Agriculture

A conservative, male-dominated Ministry of Agriculture successfully mainstreamed activities for women farmers in the western province of a southern African country. Before this programme, the Government broadly supported women's development, but few concrete operational programmes were in place.

With minimal resources and a single staff person, several committed men and women strategically used data from a field study to persuade those in existing units of the bureaucracy to bring mobile training to women, including training in oxen ploughing; to mobilize groups of women farmers for the visits of extension workers; and to generate a demand-driven agricultural extension system. The Women's Extension Program (WEP) is a successful effort (Jiggins, with Maimbo and Masona, 1992).

WEP was born amid a special rice-growing project which included a woman extension officer recruited to survey women farmers about their work, contributions to rice production, and access to agricultural services. Her data and expertise helped open up discussion on women farmers whose work in food security and family welfare was previously invisible to the largely male extension staff. The expert enlisted help from Mrs. M, an animal husbandry officer, who believed that mobilizing groups of women farmers would facilitate interaction with male staff. After some successes, managers became convinced that more strategic interventions would institutionalize large-scale change.

Mrs. M, sole staff person in WEP, was located in the home economics section but attached to the Extension Training Programme. Short courses were added to the existing training programme, and mobile courses for women took oxen-plough and other training directly to women. Mrs. M's influence was based on persuasion and cooperation rather than formal power, and bureaucratic context shaped the way the programme worked. She built networks of understanding and support with other sections.

The group method was formally adopted as part of a provincial-level People's Participation Project (PPP).

130. The case in Box III.2 shows an unsuccessful case involving women's machinery as it connects to other ministries for mainstreaming aims. Together, both cases occurred in countries wherein government commitment seemed similar, based on superficial information. Such superficial information about government gender commitments abounds in the form of reports about the existence of women's machinery or the ratification of CEDAW. What is needed is more in-depth knowledge of institutions, their gendered policy agendas, and the ways they connect with gender advocacy.

Box III.2. A Women's Bureau is unsuccessful at mainstreaming

The promise to build capacity in a Women's Bureau was not realized in a western African country. The aim of the project was to strengthen the Bureau's technical expertise; to improve its research, data collection, and documentation capability; and to strengthen its ability to implement research and programmes for women. The Bureau achieved some successes in guiding gender-sensitive planning with more reliable data.

The Government was broadly supportive of women's development, as the creation of the Women's Bureau indicates. A relatively new entity, the Bureau was unable to position itself as the national authority on women in a way relevant to macro-economic planning. When it called meetings, sectoral ministries sent low-level representatives, perhaps reflecting superficial government commitment.

Management problems in the Bureau undermined its monitoring capacity to achieve goals. Lacking sufficient resources, Bureau staff could not complete tasks once international personnel left. It tried to do too much, from advocacy to legislation to implementation, before it had sufficient capability.

Ultimately, the Women's Bureau was abolished. Had the Bureau been able to leverage macro-economic planning within sectoral ministries, or had a national development plan for women provided policy guidelines, perhaps the Bureau would have survived and thrived.

131. Women's machinery, like women/gender advocacy offices, cannot be all things to all people. When staff and resources are limited, strategies must be carefully chosen so that ultimately all parts of government, like all parts of an agency, are accountable to women. This west African Women's Bureau is a microcosm case of the structural dynamics women's advocacy faces.

B. Mainstreaming versus targeting

132. In the 1970s, specific women's projects seemed to guarantee that women would finally benefit from development efforts. Small and sometimes welfare-oriented, their impact was probably short-lived and lacked substantive effect on national policy-making. Male preference in the mainstream continued.

133. Critics challenged the separatist approach, and women/gender advocates went through a stage of defensiveness about separate women's efforts. Instead, mainstreaming ideally seeks to integrate women in each and every development sector. Mainstreaming is a strategy easier articulated than realized. Organizational transformation is necessary to move from merely mentioning women in design documents, to devising an actual plan or strategy to involve them, and

to implementation with monitorable indicators that will provide evidence of outcomes for women.

134. Targeting can be defined both as women-specific and as special efforts within mainstream projects and programmes to identify precise ways in which women will be involved and to permit measurable goals to be monitored and evaluated. Women's involvement should mean more than hiring a few female staff, though this is what may "pass" as mainstreaming in the absence of proper clarity and commitment about mainstreaming.

135. Despite the past defensiveness about women-specific efforts, ironically, most of the successful activities which agencies report are targeted to women. Women/gender advocates of the 1990s need to be less defensive about separate women's efforts, for many have proved sustainable and have been linked to mainstreaming efforts (Leonard, 1989). This is especially true for those projects that emphasize female voice and agency in influencing policy. In fact, targeting and mainstreaming are not mutually exclusive, but complementary strategies. On the whole, more recent women-specific projects are designed to link to the mainstream.

136. Mainstreaming, by one definition, implies multiple efforts within projects and programmes to involve women and document those outcomes. It must satisfy the following four criteria:

(a) Women from the recipient countries who will be participating in the programme/project must be consulted in the design stage, with priority being given to women of the target population. The project/programme document should indicate how women were consulted;

(b) Women from the recipient countries who will be involved in the programme/project must be active participants during implementation phase, with priority given to the women of the target population; that is, the document should make clear how women will be involved in implementation;

(c) Barriers to female participation must be identified in the document and measures designed in order to overcome them;

(d) WID expertise must be utilized throughout the programme/project cycle to ensure the full participation of women, and the document should make clear how this expertise and the WID factors will be applied.

137. According to another account, the following four major elements have to be taken into account if women are to be successfully integrated into technical cooperation activities:

(a) First, the needs and interests of women must be considered at the early stages of project formulation in order to eliminate discriminatory practices;

(b) Secondly, the different needs of men and women must be analysed at the design stage, and strategies developed for the benefits of both groups;

(c) Thirdly, at the implementation and evaluation stages, the different impact of programme or project intervention to men and women must be analysed and appropriate follow-up action developed;

(d) Fourthly, the active participation of women themselves and their organizations in programme design and implementation contributes significantly to the effectiveness of all technical cooperation activities.

138. Gender-targeting in programmes will always be required for certain purposes. Cultural issues and sectoral missions may dictate targeting for programme efficiency and effectiveness. Separate approaches are culturally compatible in some countries. Gender-unique needs exist in selected health interventions, making separate and targeted approaches sensible. Efforts to reduce sexual assault are typically targeted. Humanitarian agencies that work with refugees increasingly recognize the need to differentiate experiences and programming by gender, for the special violence and sexual harassment women may undergo. Without such targeting, consequences can become immediately tragic, even fatal for women. Finally, legal literacy and empowerment efforts are effective when introduced as targeted interventions.

139. In selected interventions, the discourse of mainstreaming implies the existence of female majority users. Grameen and other community banks have a track record for incorporating women. Microenterprise projects have presumable ease in generating gender-disaggregated data on borrowers. A poverty-alleviation project stressing the cultivation of cassava, a famine crop for the poor, may succeed in reaching women farmers.

1. Successful targeting

140. Box III.3 illustrates an example of successful targeting in a United Nations agency. This began as a women-specific effort which was later scaled up to a sustainable activity. This successful targeting effort shows that flexible project design, good management and accountability are as important for women-specific efforts as they are for mainstreamed efforts. In parallel, outside women's advocacy efforts facilitated project upscaling and sustainability. The project was thus able to widen its scope to deal more comprehensively with women's lives.

Box III.3. Successful, sustainable targeting

A district-level project in a South Asian country for training women in sericulture by establishing mulberry plantations and rearing silk-worms expanded from a more narrow income-generating approach into one which mobilized groups and established linkage to other programmes, such as health activities. The project gave women more income, saving them from poverty and reducing their dependence on moneylenders. The formation of women's groups was part of the expanded strategy to ensure project sustainability.

Management flexibility was key to the success of this project. Regular monitoring and reporting activities provided signals to project staff to address problems before they became insurmountable. Flexibility also allowed the project to evolve from primarily addressing practical gender needs to addressing more strategic gender needs.

The success of the project has turned the earlier small-scale effort into a larger, bank-funded national project with the potential for considerably wider impact on women. With or without funding, these women's groups now exercise more leverage for linkage to other programmes and women are better able to control their lives.

141. In three other examples of successful targeting by a sectoral agency in three world regions, the prime indicator of success was that men wanted to join efforts. This demonstrates the importance of economically viable efforts which have the broad appeal necessary for sustainability.

142. Another gender-sensitive agency supported a series of model projects which have moved from the narrow focus of health - with some educational components - to a broader focus on income-generation and women's advocacy. The specificity of the mandate of some United Nations agencies constrains their ability to act on synergies, which may limit their potential for success. One exemplary project set the scene for multiple agencies to interact with and be responsive to their female clientele in the following manner:

> Informal working groups will be established which will comprise health officials, agricultural extension workers, inland fisheries officials, and non-formal education officials from the provincial level downwards. The working groups will assist the women's committees to design, implement, and manage small-scale income generating/community development activities.

Project funding also leveraged sustained resource commitment from government agencies:

> Upon completion of the project, the Ministry of Public Health has agreed to maintain and support all women's committee community development revolving funds initially established during the project life-time, as well as to

explore with various administrative and technical units whether additional financial and technical resources can be made available.

2. Unsuccessful targeting

143. Several agencies support small projects for women with limited funding and impact that are ultimately unsustainable. These projects merely allow agencies to advertise that they "do something" for women/gender.

144. Agencies offered specific examples of problematic cases. One Latin American agricultural project targeted women as 30 per cent of credit recipients. Evaluations revealed that husbands obliged their wives to obtain loans from which they benefited leaving the wives in debt. In another agency, women defaulted at an unacceptably high rate for credit designed to generate income. It was realized that the project design did not sufficiently address women's laborious domestic duties which ultimately interfered with their businesses.

3. Successful mainstreaming: non-governmental organizations

145. Mainstreaming can occur in both government and non-government efforts. Not all non-governmental organizations are women-friendly, and some focus on women narrowly as mothers in need of welfare. Given the extensive partnership that exists between some United Nations agencies and non-governmental organizations, it is useful to explore both governmental and non-governmental efforts for mainstreaming.

146. Box III.4 illustrates the case of a large financial institution, with a long track record of supporting women. More recently, its mission focuses on females in all life-cycle stages. This case demonstrates an effectively managed model that recruits women and girls of different ages into human development. Programme efforts recognize the resource constraints of poor families and the ways those constraints particularly disadvantage females. Incentives are provided to address the resource-based "cultural" problems that result in less education for girls. Both graduates (and their families) and successful goals will help drive the demand for a public school system that serves its users more equitably.

Box III.4. A non-governmental organization successfully mainstreams girls' education

A large non-governmental organization, already recognized internationally for its rural development, credit, and health programmes, initiated a non-formal primary education programme for children that the public school system does not reach in a South Asian country. Girls were given special emphasis, because they drop out of schools earlier than boys, parents invest less in their education, and the majority of adult females are illiterate in this country.

These non-formal schools draw about two-thirds female students, taught by non-governmental organization trained and monitored teachers, two thirds of whom are also female. The non-governmental organization supplies student and teacher materials, and school hours are flexibly adapted to daily work lives to reduce income loss to families. Graduation rates are high, and a large proportion of graduates are admitted to higher levels of public education. Although girls are mainstreamed as students in the schools, mainstreaming in public education remains problematic. This case constitutes a low-cost model for increasing girls' schooling, but remaining challenges involve an inflexible public school system unsuited to female needs.

4. Successful mainstreaming: governmental initiatives

147. Few examples exist of successful mainstreaming in government programmes and projects, from design through implementation. Box III.5 is based on a comprehensively designed project that was the result of interaction between the agency's women/gender unit and the project design team to identify criteria for a fully integrated project.

Box III.5. Mainstreaming with the Ministry of Agriculture and Agrarian Reform

An agricultural investment project proposal in the southern region of a West Asian country integrates women in a way that should demonstrate mainstreaming, once implementation is under way. Its timing takes advantage of a reformed extension system in the Ministry of Agriculture and Agrarian Reform, now designed to be bottom-up in approach with ongoing data collection from farmers on their needs and activities.

Not only does a women's component exist for training and participation, but women's participation is threaded throughout all key components of the project. Targets for women are set in such activities as credit and training at levels comparable to their level of and potential for activity in the region (50 per cent). The Women's General Union, a popular organization, was involved in the design of the project and is expected to play a role in its implementation. Regular monitoring and evaluation reports go directly to a top management coordinating committee, in strategic positions to identify shortcomings and act on them. Job descriptions for virtually all consultants, not just the women's component, specify the requirement for gender awareness and experience - for example in extension, livestock husbandry, milk and dairy products processing, beekeeping, and small enterprises. All data are required to be gender disaggregated. Specific references to women and gender, of which there are many, are supplemented with activities known to be women-friendly, such as on-site and mobile training. The project promises to be a model for the mainstream.

148. This mainstream project demonstrates full and comprehensive attention to gender in productive, advocacy, and technical aspects. Even though large agencies are fragmented, the signals to managers and evaluators during implementation should be so clear and concise that women's full involvement is guaranteed. The project builds on opportune reform in the Ministry for a bottom-up approach, making it probable that Ministry officials will be eager to demonstrate their commitment to the organizational mission in a way that reflects positively on their personnel performance. Women also had a voice in the project right from the design stage; plans are firmly in place to sustain that voice through implementation. Male and female consultants alike will be required to have gender expertise, for all sectors and phases of the project.

5. Unsuccessful mainstreaming

149. The above successful example is one of the rare examples of a truly mainstreamed project in a large development agency. Unsuccessful mainstreaming is characterized by superficial and/or minuscule targeting. One chronic problem is that women are given only brief mention, followed up with the inclusion of an unambitiously targeted level of female trainees or with several female consultants. Women's components of large projects suffer from some of the same

problems for which earlier welfare efforts were criticized: they have limited productive value, consume too much time, and are not sustainable.

150. Agency reports made brief mention of other problematic examples. Insufficient attention to distance and time constraints faced by women may result in project failure. For example, in one project, the activities were too far from the village for women to attend safely while still retaining family honour. In an agricultural project women's workload increased by 2-5 hours per day without income returns. A driving efficiency orientation, even in poverty alleviation agencies, could routinely produce these kinds of results. Agencies have yet to adequately address the important issue of women's control over income from their labour, even though "incentives for labour" are commonly recognized in programmes designed for men.

C. Practical versus strategic gender needs

151. Development practitioners increasingly distinguish between practical and strategic gender interests. Practical interventions address women's needs in poverty, in crisis, and in labour-intensive work burdens. Strategic interventions address the causes of female subordination.

152. Interventions that address practical needs are quite necessary in a world where people have compelling needs which, if unmet, have tragic consequences. For example, legal advocacy, which meets strategic gender needs, will not put food into a hungry person's mouth the day she needs that food. For some agencies, interventions aimed at addressing practical gender needs may in themselves be a big step forward from their ongoing work. Agencies engaged in humanitarian and relief work, for example, are only now beginning to make the leap from their traditional activities to more development-oriented activities that would better equip refugee women and girls for their future lives on their return home. The successful case described in box III.6 illustrates the development role of humanitarian agencies in initiating activities to address practical gender needs such as girls' education.

153. It would, however, be a mistake to treat practical and strategic needs as mutually exclusive.

154. Practical gender needs remain the likely focus of most agencies. However, it is promising that terms like these are increasingly understood and used perhaps prompting movement from practical to strategic interests when opportunities are available. More and more, agencies articulate strategic activities that supplement practical ones. Even traditional sectoral organizations openly discuss legal and political change. Two of the four "spheres of influence", published and disseminated in the FAO Plan of Action (1990), are quite apt:

> Civil status seeks to improve the legal and attitudinal climate [while] decision-making seeks to increase women's involvement in decision-making through greater participation in institutions and people's organizations to train women in the skills needed to play a greater role in national and local-level policy.

Humanitarian organizations, once solely service delivery in orientation, now stress income generation, improved productivity and employment. Emergency relief organizations make the reduction of sexual assault and violence against women a significant part of their agenda. Sexual violence is treated as a violation of international law.

155. Agencies put girls' education and the revision of education curricula in their mission, linking it to high-visibility events such as the Year of the Girl Child in 1990. Several agencies work extensively with international and national non-governmental organizations, as part of concerted efforts to change national policies. UNICEF's State of the World's Children, 1992 calls for an end to the "apartheid of gender", drawing an analogy to the infamous and abhorred racial apartheid.

156. Box III.6 outlines a successful strategic gender-needs project. While women-specific in approach, it has probable long-term consequences for changing gender subordination through curricular interventions.

157. Both practical and strategic gender needs must be addressed. Long-term changes in policy, law, and curricula can address the root causes of subordination that stifle productivity and human development. Strategic gender interventions have a place in policy dialogue between Governments and development agencies. Until now, strategic interventions have been women-specific rather than mainstreamed into these policy exchanges.

Box III.6. Development role of humanitarian agencies

Ten-year-old Fatima stands in front of her class reciting a poem by an Afghan refugee about their homeland. Another child conducts a choir of girls singing in Pushtu, Afghanistan's national language. For the first time in their lives these children are getting an education.

The four schools for girls in the refugee camp at Nasir Bagh are built from compacted clay. The pupils share some old textbooks, one copy between two girls. They sit cross-legged on carpets wearing blue and white uniforms, their satchels carefully placed behind them.

"I never went to school in Afghanistan", one girl says, "but here I'm learning history, religion and arithmetic". "I'm learning Pushtu and Urdu (Pakistan's national language)", comments another, while a third girl says firmly that for her, school is the finest thing in life.

D. Conclusions

158. This chapter highlights promising shifts in technical assistance from practical to strategic gender interests and from small-scale targeting to large-scale and mainstreamed activities. The cases point to how the strategic use of procedures and accountability measures can benefit both women and men.

159. Success hinges on the commitment of Governments and healthy civil society. When Governments recognize the benefits of gender-responsive approaches, an opening is created to support local change initiatives. UNIFEM maintains that effective advocacy requires that women have the tools to hold their Governments accountable and that Governments have the tools to be accountable. It adopted a three-pronged strategy which entails:

(a) Enabling women at the grass-roots level to advocate effectively for gender-responsive development programming;

(b) Assisting Governments in integrating these demands into macro-level policy and planning;

(c) Bringing these women at the grass-roots level together with the policy makers and planners who govern their lives.

160. Non-governmental organizations are an obvious entry-point but need strengthening. A healthy civil society leads to more accountable government. However, engagement with government is also necessary. As the Human Development Report, 1993 points out, the internationally renowned Grameen Bank, a non-governmental organization, accounts for just 0.1 per cent of national credit in Bangladesh. It is a reminder of a stark reality: non-governmental organizations can supplement government but never replace it.

161. Once Governments indicate their commitment and willingness to incorporate a gender perspective, strategies can proceed. If such approaches are consistently used across agencies, the impact from the 1990s onward may be significant.

IV. FROM MAINSTREAMING TO ACCOUNTABILITY

162. This chapter draws on lessons learned about the challenge that confronts women/gender advocates in the 1990s and beyond and makes recommendations for the closing years of this century.

A. Lessons learned: towards increased demand for gender approaches

163. In general, despite policy commitments, more staff and increased resources, not all organizations have seriously institutionalized the mainstreaming of women/gender into their missions. For the past two decades advocates have used a more process-oriented inputs approach, based on gender guidelines, policies, training, and hoped-for gender diversity among professionals. Advocates have supplied inputs, though demand for such inputs has been weak. A strong foundation has been built to translate knowledge into operational terms. The burden should now be on institutions, not simply advocacy offices, to demonstrate results.

164. Efficiency and poverty-alleviation approaches have been used to make the work of development agencies more effective. These approaches integrate institutions but do not transform their technical core in ways that equity and empowerment approaches would (Lotherington, 1991). Welfare approaches continue, for they address women's practical needs and minimize the discomfort with which hesitant staff work on gender.

165. Large agencies represent a special challenge to women/gender advocacy. They are, bureaucratically speaking, the worst case scenarios in development: hierarchical, compartmentalized, and fragmented among other organizational issues. Sector agencies dominated by staff who have been educated in disciplines with ideologies that blind them to women's work represent another challenge. Yet change and momentum have developed, even in these agencies. Smaller agencies with missions most compatible with a focus on women or on women's empowerment are at the cutting edge of development assistance, whose efforts will guide other institutions. Health, population, and humanitarian agencies have developed comprehensive approaches, consistent with their mandates, that take both practical and strategic gender interests into account.

166. As the comparison of institutional strategies shows, there is no "one best process" for mainstreaming. Organizational cultures must be understood, and strategies developed within those contexts. Yet the multitude of these strategies have focused on process and inputs rather than on set goals for results that would increase activity and expenditure on an annual basis. As the third decade of advocacy begins, process approaches should be supplemented with outcomes approaches. Despite their different organizational cultures, agencies should be expected to regularly report gender activity and expenditures, through their evaluation units to their secretariat or to their lead women's mainstreaming agency.

167. Imposing rigorous expectations upon agencies as a whole will generate demand for the process-oriented inputs already put into place by women/gender

units. Ultimately professionals must stretch and learn to perform their jobs effectively. Their work is contextually specific, in technical, sector, regional and/or country offices. They cannot rely on women/gender units for every detail.

168. Osborne and Gaebler (1993) insightfully define an outcomes-oriented approach: they advise that you never tell people how to do things. Tell them what you want them to achieve and they will surprise you with their ingenuity. They criticize the control- and regulation-oriented approaches which preoccupy staff and inordinately consume resources. Perhaps development assistance agencies need reinvention themselves. Development agency staff ought to work towards the realization of more substantial gender goals in activity and expenditure levels.

B. Demand through empowerment

169. The big question for multilateral assistance agencies is: who sets gender goals, at what levels? Ultimately, it is women and men for whom accountability is necessary - accountability not only from international agencies but also from their own Governments. Historically, however, men have been overrepresented in decision-making about policy and expenditure. Women's traditional and world wide underrepresentation in public decision-making has contributed to the perpetuation of their subordination. Traditional leadership and national policies and strategies, on the other hand, often continue to reflect socio-cultural attitudes that block the realization of gender goals.

170. Women's empowerment is key to accountability. Empowered women must hold their Governments and United Nations agencies accountable for decisions. A promising trend among successful cases studied herein involves the effort to achieve greater accountability by drawing on the agency and voice of women, women's groups, and women-friendly organizations, in their interaction with Governments and international agencies. Also promising is the move towards meeting "strategic gender interests", including increasing women's participation in policy and planning.

171. An outcomes approach, driven by women's voice and agency, is even more necessary in view of the shift in international development assistance from project to programme and policy funding. Project design lends itself to detailed procedures and guidelines which can be monitored, albeit through laborious means. Programme and policy funding shifts the arena of negotiation to a different set of decision makers, from whom accountability is sought to be obtained by making financial support conditional.

172. The UNDP Human Development Index (HDI) represents a step towards identifying and ranking countries on the basis of their level of human development. The HDI is a composite measure of income, health, and education indicators; it still excludes political participation or empowerment indicators. When adjusted for gender, HDI drops in virtually all countries. Ways must be identified to regularly report a gender-adjusted HDI that includes political representation indicators for women.

173. Among conditionality levers, gender-based outcomes should be developed and efforts to achieve them documented. People-oriented outcomes, rather than token policies, should form the basis for policy dialogue between development assistance agencies and national Governments. Relevant decision makers must share stakes in the achievement and reporting of gender-disaggregated outcomes. For these reasons, gender-based evaluation is central to accountability.

C. Recommendations

174. To draw together the issues raised in previous chapters, recommendations, and measures to achieve them are offered below. The results from these actions will provide leverage to sustain momentum for policy makers.

175. To broaden and strengthen institutional accountability, chief executives are in the strategic position to authorize and fund the strategies for mainstreaming gender in agency missions. External networks and constituencies, including boards and advocacy organizations, can also press for such changes. Progressive contributors will continue to press lethargic agencies and support forward-looking agencies. Outcomes-oriented resolutions at the Fourth World Conference on Women and at other international meetings can stimulate the process. Women/gender staff can play key support roles in all these efforts, but as lone units positioned in enclaves, they lack the authority and resources to transform organizational cultures.

1. Whole-system-level recommendations

176. At the level of the whole system, the ability of evaluation units to report people-oriented gender-differentiated outcomes of development efforts must be strengthened. These efforts should be regularly monitored by the Secretariat and the appropriate intergovernmental machinery in the United Nations. Consistency across agency lines can be encouraged through joint committees, projects and agreements.

177. Gender-based outcomes can be measured by monitoring projects and programs according to their integration of gender and by monitoring total and proportionate expenditure on gender. In addition, budgets should be more transparent and formulated according to people-oriented outcomes. Goals should be set for women's activities and expenditures that increase annually and move toward balance (40-60 per cent of activities and funding for women) within a realistic time-frame of, perhaps, 10 years. The achievement or non-achievement of these goals must be reported and monitored in highly visible ways to induce change in subsequent years.

178. The comparative advantage of different agencies must be recognized so as to avoid duplication of efforts. Simultaneously, the capacity of the lead women's agency should be strengthened so as to have a guiding role in developing mainstreaming models. Mandatory financial contributions by agencies for mainstreaming may be considered in order to create a capital fund for this work.

2. Internal agency accountability

179. At the level of individual agencies, programme design and management units must be held responsible for gender outcomes. Line and country-manager staff should report gender-based outcomes as part of their annual reporting. The responsibility for project/policy design as well as implementation should be linked to quality outcomes, including outcomes for women. All institutional units, sectoral and cross-sectoral, including environment, good governance, and participation, should be required to have gender action plans with measurable outcomes. At the same time, greater spending authority should be delegated to country personnel and institutional units for gender mainstreaming initiatives.

180. Evaluation of performance on gender should be strengthened. Action on women/gender can be made one criterion for performance appraisal in personnel evaluation, with no "women/gender irrelevant" escape clauses in reporting or appraisal forms. Greater responsiveness can be ensured by imposing censures or penalties for lack of performance and correspondingly through recognition or reward for successful outcomes.

181. Suitable recruitment policies can further the mainstreaming of gender-sensitive approaches in the work of agencies. "Critical masses" of personnel with gender expertise should be recruited to staff gender focal points. Gender expertise should be required for other staff positions as well. Recruiting more personnel with gender expertise, including consultants, will generate demand for expertise acquired prior to employment and/or consultancy with agencies. Gender expertise should be made relevant to career tracks. Similarly, expectations on gender-based outcomes should be included in terms of reference for consultants and made a criterion for rehiring. In economic development agencies, the skills mix of staff can be diversified by recruiting more staff with social science-based skills.

182. Gender training within organizations can be promoted by rewarding participation in training. Care should especially be taken to ensure that male trainees, "loyal bureaucrats" and "hesitators" receive training. Follow-up action on gender training should be made mandatory.

3. Users of development assistance

183. Generally speaking, agencies providing development assistance need to recognize the diversity among women as users of such assistance. For example, the needs of females may vary by age group, from girls through the aged. Similarly, women's concerns in reproductive health vary throughout the life-cycle from unwanted adolescent sex to safe motherhood and beyond. In addition, there is a continued need to support women-specific programming along with mainstreaming activities. Within activities designed to increase women's income, renewed efforts are required to empower women with control over income derived from their labour, whether at the household level or beyond. Recent promising approaches include the attempt to target men in gendered programming. For example, reproductive health projects seek to establish responsibility among male reproducers and education projects aim to resocialize boys about gender.

184. Since development assistance is largely channelled through national Governments, greater accountability among Governments can be fostered through mechanisms such as a gender-adjusted HDI, which should include indicators of political participation and representation. Such mechanisms can be infused into the project, programming, and conditional support processes.

4. Partnerships in development assistance

185. The importance of internal and external alliance-building has been emphasized in a previous chapter. For furthering this end, agencies should be encouraged to share documentation of country gender profiles and to simplify and streamline their procedures for better inter-agency coordination. Similarly, country-level institutions should be supported in the development of gender profiles.

186. Appointing critical masses of women and/or gender experts can help in making strategic gender interests part of policy dialogue. Building alliances with women and women-friendly organizations can strengthen national level advocacy and build local capacity for good governance. Non-governmental organizations should, in general, receive greater support in developing and implementing policies for women. The goal of ensuring that 40-60 per cent of support goes to women and/or women-friendly organizations can be set for the medium term.

187. Recognizing that female empowerment is central to sustainable human development, partners in development must build strategies into all programme and project design in order to achieve this end.

D. Towards the future

188. Future efforts should emphasize institutional accountability in political contexts in which empowered women, with men, demand and drive dramatically different outcomes. Advocates working for advancing the gender agenda should recognize the explicitly political nature of their work. The policies they pursue seek to redistribute resources and power. The task of transforming agencies involves a shift in power relations inside agencies and between agencies and their clients, women and men alike. Women's engagement with the political process is necessary, whether inside bureaucracies, between bureaucracies, or in other settings. Agencies concerned with advancing gender issues must build allies at local, regional, and global levels to generate demand for institutional accountability to women as well as men.

Notes

1/ Anthony Downs refers to "advocacy", the promotion of non-routine programmes, as part 7 of the life cylce of new programmes. See his Inside Bureaucracy (Boston, Little Brown, 1967).

2/ For more on organizational culture, see Kathleen Staudt, Managing Development (Newbury Park, CA, Sage, 1991), chaps. 3 and 10.

References

Anderson, Mary B. (1993). Women on the Agenda: UNIFEM's Experience in Mainstreaming with Women, 1985-1990. New York: UNIFEM.

_____ (1990). Focusing on Women: UNIFEM's Experience in Mainstreaming. New York: UNIFEM.

Buvinic, Mayra (1986). Projects for women in the third world: explaining their misbehavior. World Development, vol. 14, No. 5.

Himmelstrand, Karen (1990). Can bureaucracies empower women? In Women, International Development and Politics: the Bureaucratic Mire. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Jahan, Rounaq (1992). Mainstreaming women in development in different settings. Paper presented at OECD/DAC/WID Expert Group Seminar. Paris, 19-20 May.

Jiggins, Janice, with Paul Maimbo and Mary Masona (1992). Breaking New Ground: Reaching Out to Women Farmers in Western Zambia. New York: Seeds.

Kanter, Rosabeth (1993). Men and Women of the Corporation. New York: Basic Books.

Kardam, Nuket (1991). Bringing Women In: Women's Issues in International Development Programs. Boulder: Lynne Reiner Publishers.

Lenox, Janne, and Desmond McNeill (1989). The Women's Grant: Desk Study Review (Including Case Studies of the World Bank and UNIDO). Evaluation Report 2.89. Oslo: Royal Norwegian Ministry of Development Cooperation.

Leonard, Ann, ed. (1989). Seeds: Women and Work in the Third World. New York: Feminist Press.

LePrestre, Philippe (1989). The World Bank and the Environmental Challenge. London and Toronto: Associated University Press.

Lotherington, Anne Therese (1991). Implementation of Women in Development (WID) Policy. Center for Development and Environment. Oslo: University of Oslo.

Moser, Caroline O. N. (1993). Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training. London and New York: Routledge.

OECD/DAC (1992). Third monitoring report on the implementation of the DAC revised guiding principles on women in development, 1989. Paris: OECD.

_____ (1993). Review of the integration of gender concerns in the work of DAC. Paris: OECD.

Osborne, Davis, and Ted Gaebler (1989). Reinventing Government. New York: Penguin/Plume.

Pietila, Hilkka, and Ingrid Eide (1990). The Role of the Nordic Countries in the Advancement of Women within the United Nations. Nordic/United Nations Project Report No. 16. Stockholm.

Poats, Susan, and Sandra Russo (1990). Training in women in development/gender analysis agricultural development: a review of expertise and lessons learned. FAO Working Paper No. 5. Rome: FAO.

Rao, Aruna, and others (1991). Gender Training and Development Planning: Learning from Experience. New York and Bergen: Population Council.

Staudt, Kathleen (1991). Managing Development. Newbury Park, California: Sage.

UNFPA. Incorporating Women into Population and Development: Knowing Why and Knowing How. New York: UNFPA.

Walker, Wallace Earl (1986). Changing Organizational Culture: Strategy, Structure, and Professionalism in the U.S. General Accounting Office. Knoxville: University of Tennessee.

Wilson, James Q. (1989). Bureaucracy. New York: Basic Books.